

**1. RUSSELL ROAD BETWEEN WALKLEY ROAD AND ST. LAURENT BOULEVARD -
TRUCK ROUTE DESIGNATION**

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION AS AMENDED

No Committee recommendation.

DOCUMENTATION

1. Director, Mobility Services and Corporate Fleet Services report dated 5 October 1999 is immediately attached.
2. Extract of Draft Minute, Transportation Committee, 20 October 1999 immediately follows the report and includes a record of the vote.
3. The following submissions have been received and are held on file with the Regional Clerk:
 - a. Hawthorne Meadows Nursery School letter dated 15 Oct 99
 - b. Canterbury Community Association letter dated 18 Oct 99
 - c. Confederation Court Tenant's Association comments dated 18 Oct 99
 - d. W.H. Sutherland comments dated 18 Oct 99
 - e. A. Hewart letter dated 19 Oct 99
 - f. Sheffield Glen Community Association letter dated 19 Oct 99
 - g. M. Della-Valle comments dated 19 Oct 99
 - h. Mr. & Mrs. C. Gordon comments dated 19 Oct 99
 - i. Mr. & Mrs. A. Markowitz comments dated 20 Oct 99
 - j. Y.L. Knight letter dated 18 Oct 99
 - k. A.H. Pond letter dated 18 Oct 99
 - l. G.J. Goudie letter dated 20 Oct 99
 - m. H. St. Denis letter dated 20 Oct 99
 - n. M. Arscott letter dated 20 Oct 99
 - o. R.E. Lavoie letter dated 20 Oct 99
 - p. A. Manley letter dated 25 Oct 99

REGION OF OTTAWA-CARLETON
RÉGION D'OTTAWA-CARLETON

REPORT
RAPPORT

Our File/N/Réf. **50 20-99-R026**
Your File/V/Réf.

DATE 05 October 1999

TO/DEST. Co-ordinator Transportation Committee

FROM/EXP. Director Mobility Services and Corporate Fleet Services
Environment and Transportation Department

SUBJECT/OBJET **RUSSELL ROAD BETWEEN WALKLEY ROAD AND
ST. LAURENT BOULEVARD - TRUCK ROUTE
DESIGNATION**

DEPARTMENTAL RECOMMENDATION

That the Transportation Committee recommend Council not approve the removal of Russell Road between Walkley Road and St. Laurent Boulevard from the Truck Route System.

INTRODUCTION

The Sheffield Glen and Canterbury Community Associations have requested that Russell Road between Walkley Road and St. Laurent Boulevard be removed from the Truck Route System as alternative routes exist. A map of that system in this area is attached as Annex A.

BACKGROUND

This portion of Russell Road has formed part of the Truck Route System for at least the past 30 years. In 1991, in response to overnight noise concerns, the hours of operation as a truck route were reduced to cover the 6 a.m. to 11 p.m. period only.

Russell Road was re-affirmed as a Regional road in the 1995 UMA Regional Road System Review. In addition, the Urban Truck Route Designation Policy indicates that any Regional road that meets the upper tier road criteria, except for urban cell service (Criterion #6) and rural cell service (Criterion #8) should also be a truck route, unless otherwise negated. Russell Road meets Criterion #1 - Urban Centre Connector, #2 - King's Highway/Upper Tier Road Connector, #3 - Heavy Industry Service and #6a - Urban Cell Service.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

If Russell Road were removed from the Truck Route System, goods movement through the area could be diverted to Lancaster Road, Sheffield Road or Highway 417.

This part of Russell is two-lane with lane widths ranging from 4.0 to 5.8 m. and paved widths ranging from 9.5 to 11.5 metres. Abutting development is primarily reverse frontage residential and includes a church/day care centre and a neighbourhood strip mall. Sidewalks are present on the west side and most of the east. There are 15 accesses and all three intersecting roads are controlled by traffic signals. It is 1.6 km. long.

Eight-hour volumes are approximately 7,500 vehicles, including 160 buses and 440 trucks (5.9 % of the traffic stream). During that period it is also travelled by approximately 50 cyclists and crossed by an average of 200 pedestrians at each of the signalized intersections.

Lancaster Road is slightly longer (2.4 km.), contains several curves and is generally narrower than Russell. Its width varies from 8.9 to 9.4 m., abutting development is commercial/institutional. Sidewalks are present on the west side and about half the east. There are 53 accesses - 49 to commercial sites, one to the Museum of Science and Technology and three to strip malls. It forms part of the City's Cycling Network and 1.5 m. bicycle lanes are in place on both sides between Walkley and the Ottawa Athletic Club, a distance of 1.6 km.

Eight-hour volumes are approximately 3,700 vehicles, including 20 buses and 340 heavy trucks (9.2% of the traffic stream). During that period it is also travelled by approximately 40 cyclists. Pedestrian crossing volumes are not available but appear to be low.

Sheffield Road is wider and longer than Russell or Lancaster. Its width is consistently 11.0 m. and all abutting development is commercial. Sidewalks are present on both sides but only on the Walkley to Bantree portion. There are 64 accesses - 26 to major activity sites. Truckers using this alternative are required to negotiate linked right/left turns at Innes and as insufficient storage is available on Bantree, frequently encounter excessive delays at that point.

Eight-hour volumes are approximately 5,300 vehicles, including 27 buses and 1,150 trucks (21.7% of the traffic stream). During that period it is also travelled by approximately 11 cyclists. Pedestrian crossing volumes are not available but also appear to be low.

COLLISION HISTORY

During the three-year period ending 31 December 1997, 18 collisions involving trucks were reported on Russell; however, in 13 of those mishaps the truck drivers were driving properly. During the same period, 9 collisions were reported on Lancaster involving trucks, in four of which truck drivers were driving properly. This may suggest that the Lancaster route is safer than Russell; however, because Russell carries double the traffic, the accident rate per million vehicles is virtually identical for the two. During that same period, 14 collisions involving trucks were reported on Sheffield.

DISCUSSION

From an infrastructure viewpoint, the Highway 417 route is the best alternative. That route is longer than the others, but it has fewer traffic signals and higher speed limits. Travel-time surveys show it can be travelled faster than Sheffield (5.1 minutes vs 6.5 minutes) and on average, takes only 90 seconds longer to complete than either Russell or Lancaster, both of which require approximately 3.6 minutes to traverse. Those surveys were conducted in off-peak periods using Walkley/Russell and Innes/St. Laurent as end points.

The need for an efficient and effective goods movement system is recognized in our Transportation Master Plan. It notes that such a system is essential to our economic livelihood and that trucking accounts for 99% of all goods movement within or through our Region. It acknowledges that trucking relies heavily on the Regional Road System for access to major industrial and commercial centres and discusses the impacts of goods movement by truck on residential communities.

From that perspective, it recognizes that while those impacts can be minimized by providing a large number of alternative routes, reduced routing options generally increase overall costs and concentrate community impacts. As a result, it goes on to mention that truck restrictions on a Regional road should be considered only where community impacts are significant, where the road in question serves exclusively non-commercial land uses, and where adequate alternative routes are available.

If Council chooses to remove Russell Road from the truck route system in favour of Highway 417, this presents a challenge because all trucks diverted to that route, especially those proceeding from south, will be required to drive past Lancaster and Sheffield and the City is opposed to increased truck volumes on Lancaster as that roadway was never designed nor intended to serve as the primary truck route through this corridor.

The obvious solution is therefore to suggest that in conjunction with the removal of Russell from that system, the City also remove Lancaster from that system. That measure would not impact “home-base or destination” trips by the goods movement industry to sites on Lancaster as those activities are clearly permitted as “exceptions” under the City’s Traffic and Parking By-law.

However, while this may suggest that removal of Russell from the truck route system is workable, the reality is that no matter how well that restriction is signed, it will not eliminate trucks from that link as it will still be viewed by some truckers as the most attractive route through the corridor since it is most direct. Moreover, if experience at similar situations is any indicator, especially as evidenced in the Merivale-Maitland-Carling corridor, meaningful compliance rates can only be achieved if, and only if, rigorous enforcement efforts are constantly applied.

SUMMARY

The Region has invested significant capital costs in reconstructing Hawthorne Road to provide a direct arterial link from Hunt Club Road to St. Laurent Boulevard via Russell Road. While an overnight truck ban is currently in effect on that link, extending that regulation to a full-time restriction cannot be justified on the basis of safety and will require significant enforcement efforts. Diverting trucks to the alternate routes will result in longer trips and higher goods movement costs. Since diverted trucks will be required to drive past Lancaster, City staff are concerned about the impacts additional truck traffic would have on that road as it was never designed nor intended to serve as the primary truck route through this corridor. As a result, they are opposed to the removal of Russell from the Truck Route System and will present a report on the matter to their Council this fall.

In view of the foregoing, this Department cannot support the removal of Russell Road between Walkley and St. Laurent Boulevard from the Truck Route System.

CONSULTATION

In November 1998, letters requesting input to this proposal were sent to the following:

- City of Ottawa;
- National Capital Heavy Construction Association;
- Canadian Construction Association;
- Greater Ottawa Truckers Association; and
- Ottawa Construction Association.

Only one response was received - from the City, (Annex B). Follow-up letters were sent in September 1999; however, to date (06 October) no additional responses have been received.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no financial implications.

*Approved by
Doug Brousseau*

JFB/sc

Attach. (2)

December 17, 1998

EW-2000-27/R123

Mr. Doug Brousseau
Director Mobility Services Division
Region of Ottawa-Carleton
111 Lisgar Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K2P 2L7

Dear Sir:

Subject: Removing Russell Road from the Regional Truck Route System

In response to the letter dated November 30, 1998 from Grant Malinsky, please be advised that this Department has been requested by City Council to provide a report on the truck route network. It is intended that this report will be tabled in February 1999 and this matter can be considered at that time. The following initial comments are provided for your consideration:

No rationale has been provided for the removal of Russell Road between St. Laurent Boulevard and Walkley Road from the truck route system. No other truck routes exist to service north-south truck traffic for approximately 5 km west of this location. Russell Road also provides a direct link with the truck route system immediately to the south on Hawthorne Road which in turn provides access to the adjacent industrial areas and the truck route along Hunt Club Road. It can therefore be expected that truck traffic will continue to use this route as opposed to diverting to less direct routes, whether this road is designated as a truck route or not.

Although Lancaster Road is designated as a truck route it is not the most desirable route due to its alignment. Lancaster Road was included in the truck route system in 1997 in order to provide the alternative link to the section of Russell Road during the period of the day when trucks are not permitted to use Russell Road. This was necessary as a result of the removal of St. Laurent Boulevard between Russell Road and Walkley Road from the truck route system. A further concern relating to Lancaster Road is its status as a bicycle route, and the impact additional day time truck traffic might have on cyclists.


Department of Urban Planning and Public Works
111 Sussex Drive, Ottawa, Ontario K1N 5A1
Tel.: (613) 244-5600
Fax: (613) 244-5474
Web Site: <http://city.ottawa.on.ca>
E-mail: planning@city.ottawa.on.ca

Service de l'urbanisme et des travaux publics
111, promenade Sussex Ottawa (Ontario) K1N 5A1
Tél. : (613) 244-5600
Télééc. : (613) 244-5474
Site Web : <http://ville.ottawa.on.ca>
C. élec. : planning@city.ottawa.on.ca

In consideration of the above, staff are not in support of the proposal to remove Russell Road between St. Laurent Boulevard and Walkley Road from the truck route system at this time. As noted above, this matter can be further reviewed during the preparation of the report on truck routes intended to be tabled with City Council in February 1999, which would finalize a position.

Should you have any questions on this matter please contact Phil Edens of the Transportation Division at 244-5300, extension 3926.

Yours truly,



E.M. Robinson
Commissioner of Urban Planning and Public Works

PWE:
Russell.wpd

c.c. Councillor Allan Higdon

Daphne Hope
Transportation Planner, Alternative Modes
Department of Urban Planning and Public Works

Extract of Draft Minute
Transportation Committee
20 October 1999

**RUSSELL ROAD BETWEEN WALKLEY ROAD AND
ST. LAURENT BOULEVARD - TRUCK ROUTE DESIGNATION**

- Director, Mobility Services and Corporate Fleet Services report dated 5 Oct 99

The following submissions were received:

- a. Hawthorne Meadows Nursery School letter dated 15 Oct 99
- b. Canterbury Community Association letter dated 18 Oct 99
- c. Confederation Court Tenant's Association comments dated 18 Oct 99
- d. W.H. Sutherland comments dated 18 Oct 99
- e. A. Hewart letter dated 19 Oct 99
- f. Sheffield Glen Community Association letter dated 19 Oct 99
- g. M. Della-Valle comments dated 19 Oct 99
- h. Mr. & Mrs. C. Gordon comments dated 19 Oct 99
- i. Mr. & Mrs. A. Markowitz comments dated 20 Oct 99
- j. Y.L. Knight letter dated 18 Oct 99
- k. A.H. Pond letter dated 18 Oct 99

John Buck, Manager, Operational Studies indicated that if trucks were removed from Russell Road, they would be diverted to alternative routes such as Lancaster Road, Sheffield Road and Highway 417. In a brief overview of these routes, he indicated the lanes are narrower on Lancaster, but all the development is commercial or industrial. There is a grade on the road as it approaches St. Laurent Boulevard. This is a local road and the City of Ottawa is opposed to any additional trucks on Lancaster as the road was not designed to be the primary truck route through this corridor. Directing the trucks to Sheffield Road may cause problems where the road intersects with Bantree/Innes. Due to the shortness of this intersection, there could be delays caused by large tractor trailers waiting to turn onto Innes. Having truckers use Highway 417 would work, but staff believe signage would be an issue with respect to directing them to this facility. In discussions with the Heavy Construction Association, staff were advised they do not want to get involved.

Mr. Buck stated that truckers prefer the most direct route and it would be difficult to enforce a no-truck ban on Russell Road. He indicated there is currently a night-time ban on heavy trucks and yet, as evidenced by complaints, truckers continue to use this route during the night. On other Regional roads, such as Maitland Avenue, which was taken out of the truck route some years ago, staff investigated the possibility of applying higher fines for those not complying, but this has proven not to be a deterrent and they are concerned the same situation would happen on Russell Road. Based on this information, staff cannot recommend its removal from the truck route system at all times.

Extract of Draft Minute
Transportation Committee
20 October 1999

Taking into consideration that Lancaster is a bicycle route, Councillor Byrne inquired whether the Regional Cycling Advisory Group (RCAG) had been consulted about the proposal which may divert truck traffic to that road. D. Brousseau explained that the City of Ottawa has indicated their reluctance to use Lancaster Road because it is a bike route. J. Buck added that the heavy truck volumes noted in the report are somewhat misleading because they are based on an 8-hour period and include other vehicles such as buses and school buses. He believed there would be twice as many trucks over a 24-hour period.

When questioned what their specific objection was to using Lancaster Road, Rob Orchin, Manager of Transportation Services, Licensing, Transportation and Buildings, City of Ottawa, advised that there was a concern from the cycling community when the city designated it as a truck route. However, they were relieved when they were told that Russell Road would be the route of choice. He confirmed that Lancaster is structurally built to carry heavy vehicles, however, it is a question of balance and its volumes would double if Russell is removed from the system.

Councillor McGoldrick-Larsen questioned at what capacity Lancaster Road is presently operating and while Mr. Orchin offered that the road could probably handle more, it is a question of balancing the other uses on that road (cycling) and the fact trucks should stay on truck routes. The councillor recognized there is more residential community off Russell Road, than off Lancaster and hence believed it would be a better route for cyclists. In this vein, she questioned whether the city had investigated the option of moving the bicycle facility off the road if more trucks were going to be diverted and Mr. Orchin advised they had not examined that option.

Councillor Hume distributed copies of his submission dated 20 October 1999, transmitting correspondence received on the matter, and to request that Russell Road be removed from the truck route system. He indicated there are day care centres and various housing developments along Russell Road and two schools behind the day care centres. He emphasized that 600 pedestrians cross Russell Road during an eight-hour period to access the park and these community facilities, including transit service, while pedestrian movements along the alternative routes are almost negligible. When the community recognized there were three alternate routes, they agreed trucks should be removed from Russell Road which has so much pedestrian activity. He noted there are even more cyclists using Russell than there are on Lancaster. He reiterated the point made previously that the trucking industry had no comment to make, which he took as an indication they do not perceive this to be an issue. With respect to the issue of compliance, he and the community associations will implement an information campaign directed to those businesses that rely on truck access through this area, aimed at educating drivers on alternative routes. He emphasized the community is committed to making this work and, in conjunction with proper signage and limited police enforcement, he believed they can

Extract of Draft Minute
Transportation Committee
20 October 1999

make a serious effort to ensure compliance. While he agreed that Russell Road will still be a busy road, without trucks it will be safer and less daunting for everyone.

Marjorie Gordon, resident, Blackstone Crescent spoke on behalf of homeowners on her street, whose main concern is the excessive truck traffic coming down Walkley Road, adding to a noise problem that is already unbearable at times. She asked that if committee approves the removal of trucks from Russell, that it consider putting a buffer zone on the north side of Walkley Road between Russell and Lancaster and to supplement the existing trees and bushes that are not doing well on that side of the road. They believe this would help reduce the noise. She agreed Lancaster is a good alternative route, noting she has seen very few cyclists on that road in the 26 years she has lived in the area.

Eric Dormer, resident, Tawney Road spoke as a trained truck driver, as a parent of a child at the Aladin Day Care Centre on Russell Road and as a member of the Ottawa Athletic Club on Lancaster Road. While he understood that the community associations are particularly concerned about noise and general safety, he supported the staff recommendation because less than 6% of the traffic on Russell is truck traffic and he opined there was more noise emanating from Highway 417 than there was from Russell. He suggested that deleting this road from the truck route system will remove the pressure to build the road properly needed as a four-laned road, with sound attenuation and pedestrian crosswalks which in his view should have been built long ago. He believed that if there is a desire to reduce the traffic in this neighbourhood, the Region should take a long-range view i.e. determining when the Hunt Club Road interchange to Highway 417 will be built to allow traffic wanting to go to the west to use Hunt Club and not to go through this part of the city. He concluded by stating he could not support removal from the system because the alternate routes could not support it and the prohibition would be unenforceable. He believed the upper and lower tier governments should work together to plan and build a proper road system for this part of the city.

M. Begin, resident, Russell Road indicated that his property is near the seniors residence and fronts onto the street. The proximity of the road to his driveway is only two feet and deters people from walking in front of his home because the heavy trucks are passing so closely. While he recognized it is a dangerous road, he suggested if it is a truck route, it should be so for the entire length of the road, day and night.

Extract of Draft Minute
Transportation Committee
20 October 1999

Councillor Davis proposed the following Motion:

That Russell Road between Walkley Road and St. Laurent Boulevard be removed from the truck route system.

Councillor Cantin was sensitive to what Councillor Hume was attempting to do, however, he also recognized that truckers will naturally want to take the shortest route. He was surprised that Lancaster and Sheffield are truck routes, given the poor pavement conditions on those roads. He stated there are several traffic control signals on this stretch of Russell Road, giving pedestrians ample opportunity to cross the road. He agreed that the volume of truck traffic going through that area is higher and he did not think truckers will be convinced to take another route, because it is not fair to force it onto another road. He supported the staff recommendation and hoped that in the future, sufficient funding can be made available to make the road a decent truck route.

Councillor McGoldrick-Larsen could not support the Motion at this time, noting there are issues which she did not feel it resolved, mainly: the cycling network system and the issue of enforcement. She believed there was a need look at it in a more cohesive way and in the future, with the extension of Hunt Club Road to Highway 417, perhaps that would be a better time to re-route trucks.

Councillor Davis commended Councillor Hume for his efforts and recognized the difficulties ward councillors are faced with in dealing with truck routes in their communities. She believed he knew best what his community needs and indicated her support in his effort to remove Russell Road from the truck route system.

Councillor Byrne stated that although this is a Regional road, she thought that the nature of the road as opposed to the nature of the local road (Lancaster) is of more relevance because it is very residential and has more activity. Based on some of the comments made today, she believed Lancaster is not an overly popular cycling route and suggested the following amendment to the Motion:

That staff consult with the Regional Cycling Advisory Group (RCAG) on designating Russell Road as a cycling route.

Councillor Kreling was sympathetic to the concerns expressed by Councillor Hume and to those put forward in writing by the community associations. However, the committee has also heard from residents who do not share the same views. He maintained that if committee supports the Motion, it would not be taking a full look at the whole community. Even at the point in time when Hunt Club Road will eventually connect to Highway 417, that particular corridor (Hawthorne/Russell/St. Laurent) still provides the most direct route for truck traffic heading north, than some other combination of streets which force trucks to make more turning movements, leading to greater risk and safety implications.

Councillor Bellemare stated that in order to remove a truck route from the system, the Region has to satisfy very high standards, which in his mind, has not been done today. This issue involves the restricting of the transportation of goods in the Region and the committee is not really looking at the overall impact to the truck route system. He objected to doing this on an ad hoc basis and in a piecemeal fashion. He stated if the committee were to consider the investment the Region has made in terms of road infrastructure, this Motion goes in the opposite direction in what committee wants to achieve. He agreed there would be serious enforcement problems in removing this truck route designation during the day.

The Committee Chair agreed there are clear alternatives to Russell Road and emphasized the need to provide a safe road for residents in the area, especially when pedestrians are the top priority in the Region's Transportation Master Plan and the Regional Official Plan.

Moved by W. Byrne

That staff consult with the Regional Cycling Advisory Group (RCAG) on designating Russell Road as a cycling route.

CARRIED

Moved by L. Davis

That Russell Road between Walkley Road and St. Laurent Boulevard be removed from the truck route system and that staff consult with the Regional Cycling Advisory Group (RCAG) on designating Russell Road as a cycling route.

LOST

YEAS: W. Byrne, L. Davis, C. Doucet, D. Holmes....4

Extract of Draft Minute
Transportation Committee
20 October 1999

NAYS M. Bellemare, R. Cantin, H. Kreling, M. McGoldrick-Larsen....4

That the Transportation Committee recommend Council not approve the removal of Russell Road between Walkley Road and St. Laurent Boulevard from the Truck Route System.

LOST

YEAS: W. Byrne, L. Davis, C. Doucet, D. Holmes....4

NAYS M. Bellemare, R. Cantin, H. Kreling, M. McGoldrick-Larsen....4